The Effectiveness of the Strategic Plan in Improving Hospital Performance

1st Nur Hidayah
Master of Hospital
Administration
Universitas Muhammadiyah
Yogyakarta
Yogyakarta, Indonesia
nurhidayah@umy.ac.id
4th Suhendar Sulaeman
Master of Management
Universitas Muhammadiyah
Jakarta
Jakarta, Indonesia
Suhendarumj@gmail.com

2nd Arlina Dewi Master of Hospital Administration Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta Yogyakarta, Indonesia arlinadewi@umy.ac.id 3rd Gofur Ahmad Master of Management Universitas Muhammadiyah Jakarta Jakarta, Indonesia gofur1973@yahoo.com

5th Luthfiatin Najwa
Master of Hospital
Administration
Universitas Muhammadiyah
Yogyakarta
Yogyakarta, Indonesia
Luthfiatinnajwa@gmail.com

Abstract—Hospital performance is a crucial role in determining hospital success and providing healthcare. The hospital's success can be assessed from the compatibility between the hospital's strategic plan and its implementation. This study investigated the strategic plan's effectiveness in improving hospital performance at two hospitals (A and B) of the Public Service Agency. The data gathered implemented the qualitative method by analyzing the secondary data and comparing the strategic plan and hospital performance to implement hospital A and B's strategic plan. This study showed that the model of the strategic plan of hospital A and B was similar. Both hospitals used the Balanced Scorecard method to assess hospital performance. Besides the strategic plan, both hospital A and hospital B had a significant improvement in hospital performance. It revealed that the average percentage of performance achievement was higher than the predetermined target. Even though several failed targets were achieved, the problems identified and the followup plan were determined to achieve the target set.

Keywords—management, performance, hospital, balanced scorecard, strategic planning

I. INTRODUCTION

Nowadays, many organizations from various fields focus on the performance assessment and what is carried out by the hospital. Hospital performance is a crucial role in determining hospital success in providing healthcare. The hospital's success in delivering health care can be

evaluated more effectively, efficiently, productively using the Balanced Scorecard (BSC). The Balanced Scorecard is one method that provides balance in hospital performance assessment by considering both financial and nonfinancial performance. This method is a tool used to solve a challenge in balancing its theories with its implementation [1]. As previously mentioned, the balance between financial and non-financial goals arranged carefully become a set of strategy. The hospital is motivated to achieve financial performance and achieve non-financial performance, leading to the financial aspect. The Balanced Scorecard requires the organization to develop a balanced performance metrics portfolio that includes four main perspectives: financial, customers, internal processes, and learning and growth [2]. Moreover, by implementing the Balanced Scorecard, the hospital's success is determined by the financial and previous perspectives.

In the past, the Balanced Scorecard was only used to evaluate company performance. Due to the development of this era, the Balanced Scorecard is developed as a strategic management tool. Many companies that have already implemented the Balanced Scorecard become management tools, both private, public, and non-profit companies in the whole world. Some companies develop the Balanced Scorecard from performance measurement tools to become a new strategic management system [2,3]. Moreover, the Balanced

Scorecard can be used as a tool to evaluate hospital performance and strategic hospital management. A. Results Organizational success depends on how well the organization can implement a Balanced Scorecard in executing strategic planning. In achieving an exemplary implementation, it needs a good foundation that depends on the Balanced Scorecard's purpose and planning and commitment levels. A Balanced Scorecard is a matching method for managing business strategy [1].

Currently, hospital performance assessment using the Balanced Scorecard only focuses on performance assessments as the final process. However, integrating the Balanced Scorecard as a hospital strategic management tool, including external and internal analysis, strategy formulation, strategy implementation, and control, is rare. Several hospitals set the hospital strategic plan, but in the implementation, the strategic plan has not been applied efficiently. Besides, a valid results evaluation was also yet to be achieved [4]. Thus, study investigates the strategic plan's effectiveness in improving hospital performance by implementing Balanced Scorecard as hospital strategic management tools. It is expected that the use of a Balanced Scorecard becomes more effective, efficient, and productive based on the hospital vision and mission.

II. METHOD

The approach used in this study was a descriptive qualitative approach. The data gathered implemented a qualitative method by analyzing the secondary data. The secondary data included hospital A and B's strategic plan and its annual accountability performance researchers analyzed the data by comparing the strategic plan and hospital performance due to implementing hospitals A and B in Jakarta, Indonesia, as a National Public Service Agency. Also, Nvivo 12 plus was applied in analyzing the data. Thus, the researchers could get detailed information regarding the strategic effectiveness in improving hospital performance at two hospitals of the National Public Service Agency. Additionally, the data regarding the strategic plan and hospital A and hospital B's performance accountability reports were obtained from the internet.

III. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

This study presents the implementation of the strategic plan of two hospitals as the National Public Service Agency. Both implemented the strategic plan for the period of 2015 – 2019 from Hospital A and B. A brief explanation of hospital A and hospital B's strategic plan as the public service agency is presented below.

Strategic Plan of Hospital A

Hospital A set the strategic plan for 2015-2019, including hospital vision and mission, to achieve the hospital's predetermined goals. The hospital vision was "Becoming the national referral hospital with integrated excellence services in 2019", while the hospital's missions consisted of four missions including; 1) Providing quality and integrated service, education, and research, 2) Improving the employee performance, competence, and welfare, 3) Carrying out good corporate governance, and 4) Providing services based on the continuum of care throughout the life cycle [5]. From those hospital vision and mission, 15 strategic targets were developed using four perspectives of Balanced Scorecard to achieve the hospital vision in 2019. The stakeholder perspective targets consist of realizing stakeholder satisfaction; realizing an excellent service, education, and research; and achieving hospital accreditation sustainability. The business process targets consist of realizing excellent and integrated service, integrated service, education, and research (AHS); realizing health network education; partnerships supporting services, education, and research; the quality assurance system, and the improvement of the hospital business process. The learning and growth targets consist of realizing a measurable and performance management integrated system; realizing a Good Corporate Governance; realizing competent human resources, and realizing facilities and integrated information systems. Financial perspectives consist of achieving income growth; and realizing cost-effectiveness in services [5]. The strategic target of each perspective is shown in Table 1.

Table 1: The strategic targets of the strategic plan of hospital-based on each Balanced **Scorecard Perspectives**

Perspectives

Strategic Targets

Stakeholder	Realizing stakeholder satisfaction
	Realizing an excellent service,
	education, and research
	Achieving hospital accreditation
	sustainability
Business	Realizing excellent and integrated
Process	service
	Integrated service, education and
	research (AHS)
	Realizing health network education
	Realizing partnerships that support
	services, education, and research
	Realizing the quality assurance
	system
	Realizing the improvement of the
	hospital business process
Learning	Realizing a measurable and
and Growth	integrated performance
	management system
	Realizing a Good Corporate
	Governance
	Realizing competent human
	resources
	Realizing facilities and integrated
	information
Financial	Achieving income growth
	Realizing cost-effectiveness in
	services

Hospital A set the Key Performance Indicator (KPI) to measure strategic targets' success level to achieve the hospital vision in 2019. There were 27 KPI sets based on the perspectives of Balanced Scorecard [5]. They are 8 indicators of stakeholder perspective, 11 indicators of business process perspective, 5 indicators of learning and growth perspective, and 2 financial perspective indicators. Additionally, the KPI of each Balanced Scorecard perspectives is presented in Table 2.

Table 2: KPI of the strategic plan of the hospital A off 2015-2019

nospitai 11	011 2015 201				
Perspecti	Strategic	KPI			
ves	Targets				
Stakehol	Realizing	Patient Satisfaction			
der	stakeholde	Index			
	r	The percentage of staff			
	satisfactio	satisfaction			
	n	The percentage of			
		student satisfaction			

Philosophical Readings XIII.4 (2021), pp. 1128-1139. 1130 Info@philosophicalreadings.org 10.5281/zenodo.5230422

	KPI of the off 2015-201	strategic plan of the
Perspecti	Strategic	KPI
ves	Targets	
	Realizing an excellent service, education, and	The level of public service agency level The success rate in multidisciplinary difficult case handling
	Achieving hospital accreditati on	The percentage number of modules per study program independently implemented at hospital A. The number of research published nationally/international Hospital accreditation achievements
Business Process	sustainabil ity Realizing excellent and integrated service Integrated service,	The percentage of integrated service cluster development The percentage of DPJP supervision of students
	education and research (AHS)	The percentage of AFI (Action for Improvement) related to the integration followed The number of documented translational research The percentage of appropriate referrals The number of
	education Realizing	mentoring programs on the network The number of KSO

Table	2:	KPI	of	the	strategic	plan	of	the
hospital A off 2015-2019								

Perspecti	Strategic	KPI
ves	Targets	131 1
ves	partnershi ps that support services, education and research	equipment procurement The number of staff attending the Sub- specialization, Doctoral and Nursing Specialties programs The number of research partnerships undertaken
	Realizing the quality assurance system	The percentage of SIPs that were followed up The percentage of medical performance achievement
	Realizing the improvem ent of the hospital business	The percentage of follow-up findings from the integration coordination meeting
Learning and Growth	process Realizing a measurabl e and integrated performan ce	Percentage of work units achieved
	managem ent system Realizing Good Corporate Governan ce (GCG)	GCG Perception Index
	Realizing competent human resources	The percentage of human resources who have competencies according to standards (job competency requirements)
	Realizing facilities and	Infrastructure reliability level Information system
Philosophical	integrated	integration level 4 (2021) pp. 1128-1139 1131

Philosophical Readings XIII.4 (2021), pp. 1128-1139. 1131 Info@philosophicalreadings.org 10.5281/zenodo.5230422

Table 2: KPI of the strategic plan of the hospital A off 2015-2019

nospital A off 2015-2019			
Perspecti	Strategic	KPI	
ves	Targets		
	informatio		
	n		
Financial	Achieving	The trend of increasing	
	income	income	
	growth		
	Realizing	Operating Income and	
	cost-	Operating Cost (OIOC)	
	effectiven		
	ess in		
	services		
	services		

The KPI score (Key Performance Indicators) was determined for each target annually to know the strategic targets' achievement progress quantitatively. Besides, the total weight of all types of KPI was 100 % [5]. Additionally, based on the performance accountability reports of the strategic plan of hospital A period of 2015-2019, the achievements of KPI annually are shown in Figure 1.



Figure 1. The KPI's achievements of Hospital A for the period 2015 -2019

on the Figure 1 regarding the achievement of Key Performance Indicator (KPI) is for the 2015 - 2019. It presents that the performance achievements of KPI exceed 100 % annually. In 2016 of Figure 1 shows that from 27 indicators based on the balanced Scorecard perspective, performance indicators' achievements exceed the targets set, which is 104,13% [6]. Besides, in 2017, hospital A also successfully achieves achievement targets, which is 113,15%. However. the percentage of performance indicators' achievement 2017 decreases in

compared to the previous year's achievement. Those achievements cannot indicate decreased performance because of differences in KPI from the previous year. Based on the revision of the strategic plan for 2015 - 2019 set in the performance accountability reports of 2017, there are nine types of the strategic target divided into 12 KPI using the Balanced Scorecard perspective [7,8]. Also, in 2018, from 12 indicators based on balanced Scorecard perspective, achievement of performance indicators in 2018 has exceeded the target set of 111, 57% [9]. In 2019 of Figure 1, performance indicators' achievement has exceeded the target set of 119, 86%. Additionally, 12 types of KPI was set in 2019 [10]. Therefore, hospital A has succeeded in achieving the targets set in a strategic plan for 2015 - 2019. The number of KPI for every year are presented in Table 3 for each perspective of the Balanced Scorecard.

Table 3: The number of KPI every year for each Balanced Scorecard perspectives

each Dala	each Balanced Scorecard perspectives					
Year	Perspecti	ve	Number of			
			indicators			
2016	Stakeholder		8			
	Business	Business				
	Process					
	Learning	and	5			
	Growth					
	Financial		2			
2017	Stakeholder		1			
	Business		6			
	Process					
	Learning	and	4			
	Growth					
	Financial		1			
2018	Stakeholder		1			
	Business		6			
	Process					
	Learning	and	4			
	Growth					
	Financial		1			
2019	Stakeholder		1			
	Business		6			
	Process					
	Learning	and	4			
	Growth					
	Financial		1			

Strategic Plan of Hospital B

Hospital B had set the strategic plan for 2015 – 2019 to achieve the hospital goals in 2019. Therefore, hospital B determined the hospital vision and mission from 2015 to 2019. The hospital vision was creating an infinite experience for all through Academic Health System (AHS), while the missions were 1) providing complete, quality and affordable health service for all society, 2) carrying out the education producing the best graduates based on the research in the international standard hospital, 3) carrying out the medical research, international standard medical education research, and interdisciplinary research to anticipate the future health problems, 4) taking an active role in assisting the central and local governments in the fields of health service, education, and medical research, and 5) carrying out integrated, effective, accountable organizational efficient. and governance to realize financial growth and reliable management [11]. 16 strategic targets were developed based on hospital vision and mission. The Balanced Scorecard method was also used to develop strategic targets to achieve hospital vision. The stakeholder perspective consisted of realizing stakeholder satisfaction; and realizing an excellent service, education, and research. The targets of the internal business process consist of realizing the AHC institution; National and International Accredited; realizing an integrated center of excellence for research, service and education; realizing service and education network system towards hospital B as acute academic tertiary care; realizing a specialist doctor education to support primary services; realizing an effective advocacy system for stakeholders; realizing a system of governance and quality assurance at the work unit level, and realizing a seamless and integrated business process. The learning and growth targets consist of realizing the accelerations of IT integration; realizing the hospital B to be the best place to work; realizing the culture of helping and performing; and realizing the staff with superior comprehensive competencies with an integrative and interdisciplinary approach. Besides, the financial perspectives' targets consist of realizing strategic public-private partnership; realizing the cost-containment in education, service, and research. The strategies of each perspective are presented in Table 4.

Table 4: The strategic targets of the strategic plan of hospital-based on each Balanced **Scorecard perspectives**

Perspectives	Strategic Targets
Stakeholder	Realizing stakeholder satisfaction
	Realizing an excellent service,
	education, and research
Internal	Realizing the AHC institution
Business	National and International
Process	Accredited
	Realizing an integrated center of
	excellence for research, service and
	education
	Realizing service and education
	network system towards hospital B
	as acute academic tertiary care
	Realizing a specialist doctor
	education to support primary
	services
	Realizing an effective advocacy
	system for stakeholders
	Realizing a system of governance
	and quality assurance at the work
	unit level
	Realizing a seamless and integrated
	business process
Learning	Realizing the accelerations of IT
and Growth	integration
	Realizing the hospital B to be the
	best place to work
	Realizing the culture of helping and
	performing
	Realizing the staff with superior
	comprehensive competences with
	an integrative and interdisciplinary
	approach
Financial	Realizing the strategic public,
	private partnership
	Realizing the cost-containment in
	education, service, and research

Hospital B had determined the Key Performance Indicator (KPI) to measure strategic targets' success level, helping the hospital achieve the hospital vision in 2019. There are 31 KPI determined based on the Balanced scorecard perspectives [11], including 6 indicators of stakeholder perspective, 14 perspectives of internal business process, 8 indicators of learning and growth perspective, and 3 indicators of financial perspective. Then, the KPI Philosophical Readings XIII.4 (2021), pp. 1128-1139. 1133

of each Balanced Scorecard perspectives is presented in Table 4.

Table 5: KPI of the strategic plan of hospital B period 2015-2019

Perspectives	Strategic	KPI			
_	Targets				
Stakeholder	Realizing	Patient			
	stakeholder	satisfaction level			
	satisfaction	Student			
		Satisfaction			
		Level			
	Realizing an	The number of			
	excellent	translational			
	service,	research applied			
	education, and	in services			
	research	The percentage			
		of complicated			
		cases that are			
		managed			
		(survive or die			
		with good			
		quality.			
		The number of			
		new types of			
		complicated			
		cases to model			
		(yan, lit, etc.)			
		The percentage			
	of graduates who				
	gain more				
		experience and			
		competence from standard			
Internal	Realizing the	The issuance of			
Business	AHC institution	the legal basis			
Process		for the formation			
		of the AHC			
		The percentage			
		of integrated			
		business			
		processes			
		managed by			
		AHC			
	National and				
	International	LAM-PTKes			
	Accredited	accreditation			

Table 5: KPI of the strategic plan of hospital B period 2015-2019

Perspectives Strategic KPI

Strategic	KPI
Targets	
Realizing an	The number of
integrated	centers of
center of	excellence for
excellence for	research, service
research,	and education
service and	integrated with
education	excellent
	performance
Realizing	The percentage
service and	of inappropriate
education	referrals to
network system	hospital B
towards	The number of
hospital B as	assisted hospitals
acute academic	that can become
tertiary care	a back referral
	hospital
	Number of
	Network
	Hospital training
	education
	programs
	implemented by
Doolisins o	Hospital B The number of
Realizing a	
specialist doctor education to	graduates who work in the
support primary	primary health
support primary services	network system
sei vices	of hospital B
Realizing an	The number of
effective	results of
advocacy	strategic studies
system for	used for
stakeholders	advocacy to
stanciforacis	stakeholders
Realizing a	The percentage
system of	of 20 work units
governance and	(Units & Dept)
quality	that get excellent
assurance at the	scores (ISO
work unit level	governance,
	leadership,
	continuous
	improvement,
	integration of
1' VIII 4 (2021)	- 1120 1120 1124

Table 5: KPI of the strategic plan of hospital B period 2015-2019

period 2015-2		1/DI
Perspectives	Strategic Targets	KPI
	Turgets	education,
		services and
		research)
		The percentage
		of work units
		carry out the
		RTL (Follow-up
		Plan) of internal
		quality audits
		and tracers
		The percentage
		of work units
		achieving
		excellent medical
		indicators (JCI)
	Realizing a	The number of
	seamless and	BTP (Break Thru
	integrated	Project) that has
	business	been successfully
	process	implemented
Learning	Realizing the	IT integration
and Growth	accelerations of	level
	IT integration	C' CC '. C '.
	Realizing the	Staff satisfaction
	hospital B to be	index to the
	the best place to	system and work
	work	environment
	Realizing the culture of	The percentage of medical staff
	helping and	with excellent
	performing and	performance
	performing	The percentage
		of non-medical
		staff with
		excellent
		performance
		AHC
		performance
		culture index of
		hospital B
		1

Table 5: KPI of the	strategic	plan	of	hospital B	
period 2015-2019				_	

Danama addina			I/DI		
Perspectives	Strategic		KPI		
Targets					
	Realizing	the	The percentage		
	staff	with	of medical staff		
	superior		who have		
	comprehensive		integrative and		
	competences		interdisciplinary		
	with	an	behaviors		
	integrative	and	(follow primary		
	interdisciplinary		clinical doctor		
	approach		education, have a		
			certificate of		
			Good Clinical		
			Practice, have		
			handled difficult		
			medical cases)		
			The percentage		
			of non-medical		
			staff who have		
			the appropriate		
			competence		
			The percentage		
			of work unit		
			leaders who have		
			managerial		
			competence		
Financial	Realizing	the	The number of		
	strategic p	ublic,	new services		
	private		whose financing		
	partnership)	is PPP-based (>		
	_		10M)		
	Realizing	the	The fairness		
	cost-		level of service		
	containmen	nt in	costs, education		
	education,		and research-		
	service,	and			
	research		containment		

The KPI score (Key Performance Indicators) was determined for each target annually to know the strategic targets' achievement progress quantitatively. Besides, the total weight of all types of KPI was 90 % [11]. Based on the strategic plan of hospital B period 2015-2019, the achievements of KPI annually are shown in Figure 2.



Figure 2. The KPI's achievements of Hospital B for the period 2015 -2019

on the Figure 2 regarding Based achievement of Key Performance Indicator (KPI) for 2015 - 2019. It shows that the performance achievements of KPI exceed the target set annually. In 2016 of Figure 2, 29 indicators succeed in achieving the target with the achievement of 94%. It presents that hospital B has succeeded in achieving the overall of the Key Performance Indicators (KPI). There are several achievements achieved hospital regarding by В implementation of Key Performance Indicators (KPI) 2016 such as; 1) sustaining the international accreditation of JCI (Joint Commission International), 2) sustaining the accreditation of the Hospital Accreditation Committee (KARS), and 3) (International Organization Standardization) re-certification [12]. Besides, there was a 29 KPI target set in 2017. The hospital B also has successfully achieved the target of KPI with the achievement of 98%. It is revealed by the achievement of A category regarding the public service's health level [13]. Also, in 2018, there were 26 KPI set by hospital B. The performance achievements of hospital B are 95%. It that hospital B has successfully achieved almost the KPI. However, KPI of 2018 were different from the previous year because some indicators were removed. Thus, hospital B determined 26 KPI and the targets to achieve the hospital vision and mission [14]. The last, in 2019, the performance achievements of hospital B is 96,15%. It presents that almost the overall KPI have been achieved. 16 KPI had been set for achievements in 2019 [15]. Thus, the number of KPI for every year is presented in Table 3 for each Balanced Scorecard perspectives.

Table 6: The number of KPI every year for each Balanced Scorecard perspectives

Year	Perspective		Number of
	-		indicators
2016	Stakeholder		5
	Business		13
	Process		
	Learning	and	8
	Growth		
	Financial		3
2017	Stakeholder		5
	Business		13
	Process		
	Learning	and	8
	Growth		
	Financial		3
2018	Stakeholder		5
	Business		11
	Process		
	Learning	and	8
	Growth		
	Financial		2
2019	Stakeholder		2
	Business		6
	Process		
	Learning	and	6
	Growth		
	Financial		2

The similarity of the strategic plan of hospital A and hospital B

There are similarities from the strategic plan models, both hospital A and hospital B, as public service hospitals. They are voyage plans, summary, table of contents, method, and tools used in determining strategic position which used SWOT and TOWS analysis. Besides, there are similarities in the calculation of SWOT analysis weights regarding the calculation of opportunities, threats, strengths, and weaknesses analysis, which have 1 or 100% each calculation [5,11]. However, in the revision of the strategic plan of hospital A for the period 2017 - 2019, those errors had been corrected, the total weight of the opportunities and threats analysis was one. Likewise, the total weights of strengths and weaknesses analysis were one [5].

B. Discussion

Both hospital A and hospital B had set the hospital strategic plan to facilitate its overall

hospital goals [5,11].In designing and implementing the hospital strategic plan, both hospitals adopted the Balanced Scorecard Method. The Balanced Scorecard concept has been widely used by manufacturing and service companies, a non-profit organization, and government entities over the years [16] since Kaplan and David Norton introduced it in the early of 1990s [17]. The hospital had adopted the Balanced Scorecard method to measure hospital performance and achieve the hospital goals [18]. In implementing the hospital strategic plan, both Hospital A and Hospital B had previously determined the strategy and hospital performance indicators.

Before implementing the hospital strategic plan, both hospital A and hospital B set: First, the hospital determined the hospital vision to create an overview of its overall goals. Additionally, the hospital vision presented strategies to achieve hospital goals [16]. After hospital vision was determined, the hospital developed the hospital vision into a hospital mission number [16]. Hospital A developed four missions from the hospital vision: providing quality and integrated service, education, and research; improving employee performance, competence, and welfare; carrying out good corporate governance; and providing services based on the continuum of care throughout the life cycle [5]. Also, hospital B defined five hospital missions. They consisted of providing complete, quality, and affordable health service for all society; carrying out the education producing the best graduates based on the research in the international standard hospital; carrying out medical research, international standard medical education research, and interdisciplinary research to anticipate the future health problems: taking an active role in assisting the central and local governments in the fields of health service, education, and medical research; and carrying out integrated, effective, efficient, and accountable organizational governance to realize financial growth and reliable management [11].

The hospital strategies also were defined based on the hospital's vision and mission. Both hospital A and hospital B develop the strategy map to translate vision into strategies [16] as an effort to achieve the hospital's predetermined goals. The hospital strategies were developed based on four perspectives of the Balanced Scorecard [18],

namely, financial and non-financial perspective [3]. Simultaneously, non-financial perspectives consist of customer perspective, internal business perspective, and learning and growth perspective [3]. There were 15 strategies formulated by hospital A [5], and there were 15 strategies formulated by hospital B [11]. Also, 4 Balanced Scorecard was combined and completed to communicate the hospital vision strategies [3]. Moreover, the strategy map formulate the hospital strategies and guide the hospital to execute the strategies [19].

After the hospital vision, mission, and strategies had been formulated, hospital A and hospital B strategies into several developed the Performance Indicators (KPI) based on each Balanced Scorecard perspective [20]. There were several KPI agreed by the hospital as an effort to achieve the hospital vision. Hospital A agreed to 27 KPI in 2016 [5,6], 12 KPI in 2017 [7,8], 12 KPI in 2018 [9], and 12 KPI in 2019 [10]. Besides, hospital B defined 31 KPI in 2016 [11,12], 29 KPI in 2017 [13], 26 KPI in 2018 [14], and 16 KPI in 2019 [15]. The target and score of KPI were defined based on each of Balanced Scorecard perspective [20]. Thus, both hospital A and hospital B have evaluated KPI's achievement annually [21]. The KPI evaluation was to check whether the KPI achievement met the target set or not. The KPI with a high achievement meant that the KPI succeeded in achieving the goals. Thus, KPI's total score was calculated to get a clear overview of hospital performance overall [21]. Also, due to pandemic of covid-19, the hospital needs to create a hospital strategic plan with a creative and reasonable approach to overcome problems that might occur [22]. Besides, in creating a strategic plan, a health care system must be smart in allocating healthcare workforce and resources. It remembers that the healthcare workforce and resources play one of the main roles in overcoming the global crisis[22].

This study only used secondary data as the instrument of the study accessed from the internet. The secondary data included the hospital strategic plan and hospital A and hospital B's performance 1. What is Balanced Scorecard? In: Essentials of accountability report. Besides, due to the pandemic of Covid-19, this study was not followed by interviews with the hospital. situations and conditions that do not allow.

IV. CONCLUSION

The strategic plan of hospital A and B have many similarities regarding the implementation of the strategic plan. Both hospital A and hospital B adopted the Balanced Scorecard method in translating the strategies to achieve the desired hospital goals in the form of the hospital strategic plan. The Balanced Scorecard method is believed to be the method designed to realize the hospital goals [21]. On the other hand, hospital A and hospital B's strategic plan also have differences regarding hospital A and hospital B's strategic plan. Both hospitals' achievements performance can be measured by evaluating hospital performance annually, which has different hospital characteristics related to human resources or other hospital resources. Besides the implementation of the strategic plan, both hospital A and hospital B were effective. It revealed that the average percentage of performance achievement was higher than the predetermined target. However, several targets failed to achieve, but the problems identified and the follow-up plan were determined to achieve the target set.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The researchers thank all parties who were involved in making this research possible. The first was Institutions of Research, Service, Publication (LP3M) University Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta, which has facilitated during this research regarding the research, namely "The Effectiveness of the Strategic Plan in Improving Performance." Hospital The second Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta, which held the International Conference of Sustainability Innovation (ICOSI) 2020. Last but not least was the Master of Hospital Administration, Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta, which held the 5th International Conference of Hospital Administration (ICHA) becoming a part of the International Conference of Sustainability Innovation (ICOSI) 2020, which facilitated the researcher in publishing this paper.

REFERENCES

- Balanced Scorecard. 2012. Hoboken, NJ, USA. John Wiley & Sons, Inc.: 13–31.
- because of the 2. Hwa M, Sharpe BA, Wachter RM. Development and implementation of a balanced scorecard in an

- academic hospitalist group: Academic Hospitalist Balanced Scorecard. J Hosp Med. 2013;8(3):148–153.
- 3. Kaplan RS, Norton DP. Putting the Balanced 13. Laporan Scorecard to Work. In: *The Economic Impact of Knowledge*. 1998. Elsevier: 315–324. Mangunkus
- 4. Sadeghifar J, Jafari M, Tofighi S, Ravaghi H, Maleki MR. Strategic Planning, Implementation, and Evaluation Processes in Hospital Systems: A Survey From Iran. GJHS. 2014;7(2):p56.
- 5. Rencana Strategis Bisnis RSUP Fatmawati Tahun 2015 2019. http://rsupfatmawati.id/assets/pdf/RSB2015-2019Awal.pdf. Accessed 2 November 2020.
- 6. Laporan Akuntabilitas Kinerja RSUP Fatmawati Tahun 2016. http://rsupfatmawati.id/assets/pdf/LAPORANAK UNTABILITASKINERJATAHUN2016.pdf. Accessed 3 November 2020.
- 7. Laporan Akuntabilitas Kinerja RSUP Fatmawati Mangunkus Tahun 2017. November http://rsupfatmawati.id/assets/pdf/LAKIP2017.pdf. 15. Laporan Accessed 3 November 2020. Pemerintah
- 8. Revisi Rencana Strategi Bisnis RSUP Fatmawati Tahun 2017 2019. https://erenggar.kemkes.go.id/file2018/e-performance/1-415432-4tahunan-561.pdf. Accessed 3 November 2020.
- 9. Laporan Akuntabilitas Kinerja RSUP Fatmawati Tahun 2018.pdf. .
- 10. Laporan Kinerja RSUP Fatmawati Tahun 16. 2019.pdf. Bahttp://rsupfatmawati.id/assets/pdf/LAPORAN%20 MKINERJA%20RSUP%20FATMAWATI%20TAH AGUN%202019-dikompresi.pdf. Accessed 3 17. November 2020. Str
- 11. Rencana Strategis Bisnis RSCM FKUI 2015 2019 (Update 2019) RSCM. https://www.rscm.co.id/index.php?XP_webviewru jukan_menu=0&pageid=278&title=Rencana%20S trategis%20Bisnis%20RSCM%20-%20FKUI%202015%20-%202019%20(Update%202019). Accessed 2 November 2020.
- 12. Laporan Akuntabilitas Kinerja Instansi 19. Pemerintah (LAKIP) RSUPN Dr. Cipto M. Mangunkusumo Tahun 2016. 20. https://www.rscm.co.id/index.php?XP_webviewru M. jukan_menu=0&pageid=58&title=Laporan%20Ak Se untabilitas%20Kinerja%20Instansi%20Pemerintah an

- %20(LAKIP)%20RSUPN%20Dr.%20Cipto%20M angunkusumo%20Tahun%202016. Accessed 3 November 2020.
- Akuntabilitas Kinerja Instansi Pemerintah (LAKIP) **RSUPN** Dr. Cipto Mangunkusumo 2017. Tahun https://www.rscm.co.id/index.php?XP_webviewru jukan_menu=0&pageid=192&title=Laporan%20A kuntabilitas%20Kinerja%20Instansi%20Pemerinta h%20(LAKIP)%20RSUPN%20Dr.%20Cipto%20 Mangunkusumo%20Tahun%202017. Accessed 3 November 2020.
- 14. Laporan Akuntabilitas Kinerja Instansi Pemerintah **RSUPN** (LAKIP) Dr. Cipto 2018. Mangunkusumo Tahun https://www.rscm.co.id/index.php?XP_webviewru jukan_menu=0&pageid=233&title=Laporan%20A kuntabilitas%20Kinerja%20Instansi%20Pemerinta h%20(LAKIP)%20RSUPN%20Dr.%20Cipto%20 Mangunkusumo%20Tahun%202018. Accessed 3 November 2020.
- Akuntabilitas Kineria Instansi Pemerintah (LAKIP) **RSUPN** Dr. Cipto 2019. Mangunkusumo Tahun https://www.rscm.co.id/index.php?XP_webview_ menu=0&pageid=275&title=Laporan%20Akuntab ilitas%20Kinerja%20Instansi%20Pemerintah%20(LAKIP)%20RSUPN%20Dr.%20Cipto%20Mangu nkusumo%20Tahun%202019. Accessed November 2020.
- 16. Kaplan RS, Norton DP. Transforming the Balanced Scorecard from Performance Measurement to Strategic Management: Part I. Accounting Horizons. 2001;15(1):87–104.
- 3 17. Smith RF (ed.). Balanced Scorecard and Strategic Initiatives. In: *Business Process Management and the Balanced Scorecard*. 2015.

 Hoboken, NJ, USA. John Wiley & Sons, Inc.: 166–218.
 - 18. Salinas M, López-Garrigós M, Flores E, Santo-Quiles A, Gutierrez M, Lugo J, et al. Ten years of preanalytical monitoring and control: Synthetic Balanced Score Card Indicator. Biochem Med. 2015;49–56.
- Instansi 19. Webster DW, Cokins G. Value-Based Cipto Management in Government. 2020;20.
 - 20. Cattinelli I, Bolzoni E, Barbieri C, Mari F, Martin-Guerrero JD, Soria-Olivas E, et al. Use of Self-Organizing Maps for Balanced Scorecard analysis to monitor the performance of dialysis

- clinic chains. Health Care Manag Sci. 2012;15(1):79-90.
- F, Barbieri C, Mari F, et al. Computational intelligence for the Balanced Scorecard: Studying performance trends of hemodialysis clinics.
- Artificial Intelligence in Medicine. 2013;58(3):165–173.
- 21. Cattinelli I, Bolzoni E, Chermisi M, Bellocchio 22. Ehrlich H, McKenney M, Elkbuli A. Strategic planning and recommendations for healthcare workers during the COVID-19 pandemic. The American Journal of Emergency Medicine. 2020;38(7):1446–1447.