Horizon Research Publishing Corporation

Peer Review Report

Notes

Please return the completed report by email within 21 days;

About HRPUB

Horizon Research Publishing, USA (HRPUB) is a worldwide open access publisher serving the academic research and scientific communities by launching peer-reviewed journals covering a wide range of academic disciplines. As an international academic organization for researchers & scientists, we aim to provide researchers, writers, academic professors and students the most advanced research achievements in a broad range of areas, and to facilitate the academic exchange between them.

Manuscript Information

Manuscript ID:	**10436373**
Manuscript Title:	**Soil Organic Matter and Its Correlation with Several Chemical Properties of Inceptisols in Rice Fields in Java**

Evaluation Report

General Comments	
Advantage & Disadvantage	**Advantages:** **The Introduction well substantiates the research background and clearly explains its reasons and aims.** **Very good, detailed, and explanatory presentation of Inceptisols as well as their economic and social importance.** **The data are clearly presented in tables.** **Clear Discussions on Inceptisols chemical properties and their importance for soil fertility and rice growing.** **Disadvantages:** **A reference base is not referred to for the soil type.** **Lack of some references for framing soil chemical characteristics.** **Inceptisols are presented as having 10-31% organic matter contents in the Introduction whereas the present research has found much lower values.** **Recommending "optimizing the use of Inceptisol in rice fields" is too vague, too general.**
How to improve	**Refer the soil type (Inceptisol) to a reference soil data base.** **Give a reference for framing soil chemical characteristics (humus, pH, nitrogen, BS, etc.) into classes (low, medium…/acid…).** **Humus contents are indeed low to medium so avoid using "high" for describing the first layers (firs paragraph in 3.1. subsection).** **Maybe give some explanation on the contrast between the Inceptisols organic matter contents as presented in the Introduction (10-31%) and the much lower values found**

	by the present research. **Calculating C/N ratio could provide information on the quality of organic matter which is also of importance in assessing the soil fertility properties.** **Add the DOI for the references to articles that have these identifiers (it is the case of at least [1].** **Some assertions about soil phosphorus contents and CEC (3.1. subsection) need references.** **Potassium contents (K) was not analyzed in the soil samples. Is this element not of interest for rice growing?** **Give some details on the recommendation to optimize "the use of Inceptisol in rice fields".**

Please rate the following: (1 = Excellent) (2 = Good) (3 = Fair) (4 = Poor)

Originality:	**2**
Contribution to the Field:	**2**
Technical Quality:	**1**
Clarity of Presentation :	**1**
Depth of Research:	**3**

Recommendation

Kindly mark with a ■

☐ Accept As It Is	
■ Requires Minor Revision	
☐ Requires Major Revision	
☐ Reject	

Return Date: _____