

# Public Policy Implementation of the Jakarta Government's Policy: Study of Community Relocation Around the Reservoir

*by Evi Satispi*

---

**Submission date:** 31-Mar-2023 08:42AM (UTC+0700)

**Submission ID:** 2051563497

**File name:** IMPLEMENTATION\_PUBLIC\_POLICY.pdf (370.49K)

**Word count:** 10935

**Character count:** 58612

## **Public Policy Implementation of the Jakarta Government's Policy: Study of Community Relocation Around the Reservoir**

### **Evi Satispi**

Associate Professor  
Department of Postgraduate Public Administration, FISIP  
**University of Muhammadiyah Jakarta**

### **Azhari Aziz Samudra**

Department of Postgraduate Public Administration, FISIP  
**University of Muhammadiyah Jakarta**

*Received:* April 28, 2021

*Accepted:* May 11, 2021

*Published:* October 1, 2021

#### **Corresponding Authors:**

evi.satispi@umj.ac.id;

prof.samudra@gmail.com

DOI: 10.53947/tspj.v1i1.65

**Abstract:** *This study aims to understand the Jakarta government's policy in relocating people from the Ria Rio Reservoir and placing them in flats (rusunawa). Based on the research findings that have been done, it is concluded that strict facility restrictions are necessary to prevent the transfer of rental rights from low-income people to the upper class. The existence of a Management Agency is deemed necessary by residents. It is evidenced by the high number of answers residents require of a Management Agency and supported again by the feeling of obedience to the residents' management board. Constraints in the provision of housing on the need side It is difficult to invite low-income people and residents of slums who are generally classified as poor to want to live in apartment units. Performance measurement cannot be done only on a one-year deadline. Performance has been disrupted by past policies that have prevented the achievement of housing development targets (rusunawa) from being fully met. A synergy between regional and central interests is needed. Program handling must be in synergy with other program policies.*

**Keywords:** *Policy Implementation, Relocation Of Residents, Waduk Rio-Rio, Management Agency, Jakarta Government Policy*

### **Introduction**

Under Law Number 32 of 2004 concerning Regional Government. In the administration of government affairs, which are the authority of the regions as referred to in paragraph (1), regional governments exercise the broadest possible autonomy to regulate and manage government affairs themselves based on the principles of autonomy and assistance tasks. As mentioned in paragraph (1), government affairs include foreign policy, land, security, judiciary, national monetary and fiscal, and religion. Regional

governments that regulate and manage their government affairs according to autonomy and assistance tasks are directed to accelerate the realization of community welfare through improvement, service; as the capital of the State, Jakarta is given the title of an extraordinary territory. As a consequence of this status and predicate, Jakarta has been given special autonomy in the form of single autonomy whose implementation is at the level (Arka 2007). This special autonomy is contained in Law Number 29 of 2007 concerning the Provincial Government of the Special Capital Region of Jakarta as the capital of the Unitary State of the Republic of Indonesia (Gayo and Yeon 2013).

As the capital city of the Republic of Indonesia, Jakarta Province certainly has various very complex problems compared to other regional provinces in Indonesia, both in the economic, political, social, and cultural fields and others. In addition, the status of the Jakarta Capital as a metropolitan city with a variety of living facilities is undoubtedly desirable to residents from outside Jakarta to come/inhabit or become residents of Jakarta. However, the rapid population growth has resulted in the narrowness of the available residential land in Jakarta City, while not being matched by the increasing quality of life of the people, causing them to be unable to have a decent place to live and in the end, illegal/slum settlements are formed as one of the impacts of this.

The rapid urbanization in big cities and metropolitan areas has caused problems with the limited availability of land for housing. To provide decent housing for low-income people, the construction of simple flats (rusuna) is one solution in providing vertical housing by utilizing land effectively and efficiently. The Jakarta Government, until 2006, has provided 19,324 flats spread over 30 locations in the Jakarta Municipality Area (Statistics 2020). The target for the construction of flats for 2007-2011 is to fulfill the need for comfortable flats in Indonesia as many as 1,000 towers or around 350,000 units of flats, with affordable rental/selling prices for low-middle income people in urban areas with a population of more than 1. The basic concept of urban flats is a spatial arrangement that produces a healthy urban environment with the most efficient land use. The problem is that the construction of flats never considers the target groups of users or their users. Economic activity in urban areas, especially in big cities in Indonesia, is generally supported and driven by various groups and various socio-economic strata of society. In Jakarta, the construction of flats has become a necessity because the availability of urban land is increasingly complex and expensive. The flat construction apartments have been carried out in line with the development of Jakarta as a megacity. Therefore, economic activity in the service sector has become a dominant factor for Jakarta. All forms of a service system are required to run faster and more efficiently.

At the end of 2012, the provincial government of Jakarta held a regional head election which Mr. Joko Widodo won and his Deputy, Mr. Basuki Tjahya Purnama, as the pair of Governor and Deputy Governor for the period 2012-2017. With the election of the Governor and deputy governor, a new vision and mission were born in implementing the wheels of government in the Jakarta Province. The main thing that becomes the program of the Governor and his Deputy is to prioritize improving the quality of services to the community, especially the problems of the citizens of Jakarta, and a critical problem is a service of providing decent housing. One of the Jakarta Regional Government policies in settlements is to relocate residents in slum settlements such as on the banks of rivers to simply rented flat/rusunawa (Ariastita and Septanaya 2020). Various problems arise

related to this policy. People who have lived in slums for a long time have become accustomed to an inappropriate environment with bad habits such as littering, lack of personal health, and others. The habits and mindsets of the people formed like that cannot be immediately changed to what the Jakarta Provincial Government expects. This policy is not immediately acceptable to all levels of society and can be accepted by all people living in slums. However, the Jakarta government continues to strive to implement policies that have been issued in the service housing sector that do not fail. Various efforts continue to be made by the Regional Government, such as repairing the facilities in the Rusunawa that the residents will occupy (Simanjuntak 2017).

### **Formulation of problems**

Based on the description above, the authors identify the problems that occur in this study, namely:

- a. There are still officials who do not comply with the policies set by the Jakarta Regional Government.
- b. There are still officials who, when implementing policies, are guided by the rule that the apparatus is the "king" so that it must be served by the community, not serving the community.
- c. The apparatus is not responsive to the problems that occur.
- d. The public service bureaucracy shows a lousy service attitude.
- e. The public service bureaucracy has not realized the principles of justice and equality of treatment in implementing public services.
- f. The work procedure is too complicated.
- g. The socialization carried out by the Jakarta Regional Government has not been optimal for the community regarding the new policy.
- h. The increasing population of Jakarta City is difficult to control, while the land for residential areas is decreasing.
- i. The low level of public understanding of Jakarta's local government policies.
- j. Lack of community empowerment efforts that can improve the performance of residents, economic empowerment of residents, residents' attention to their environment.

Based on the background and limitation of the problem above, the core problems in this research are the factors that hinder the implementation of the government's policy of relocating the residents of the Ria-Rio Reservoir, Kayu Putih Village to Simple Rent Flats (Rusunawa) West Cakung Sub-District? What factors support implementing the government's policy of relocating the residents of the Ria-Rio Reservoir, Kayu Putih Village, to Simple Rent Flats (Rusunawa) West Cakung Sub-District?

### **Research Methods**

Starting from the research objectives formulated, the researchers determined that this study used a descriptive method with a qualitative approach. This type of descriptive research method was chosen because the researchers wanted to get an overview of the

ongoing process, which is about implementing government policies to relocate residents of the Ria-Rio reservoir, Kayu Putih Village. Following the theory put forward by Creswell (2013), "descriptive research is the most basic form of research. It is intended to describe or describe existing phenomena, both natural phenomena or human engineering (Ishtiaq 2019). Researchers in this study set officials in the Kayu Putih Village as resource persons, including the following:

- a) Head of Kelurahan, as a source of information about policies and programs of organizational performance in general.
- b) Secretariat, as a source of information on reports on the implementation of activities and evaluation of activities.
- c) Service and preservation sector, as a source of information about carrying out services.
- d) Development Sector, as a source of information-carrying out development.
- e) Field of Information and Correctional System Development, as a source in providing management of information and correctional system development.

## **Discussion**

The increase in population in cities creates serious problems in urban areas. Indonesia is a developing country with a higher urban population growth rate than the national population growth rate. In 2010, the number of Indonesians living in cities reached 52% of the total population, and in 2025, it is predicted that the number of people living in cities will reach 65%, namely 195 million people. This condition has an impact on the increasingly limited urban space. Jakarta has the highest population density in Indonesia per km<sup>2</sup> (Statistics 2020). Therefore, urban space is increasingly pressing in Jakarta City, causing environmental problems, one of which is flooding. To overcome flooding, the Provincial Government of Jakarta normalized 12 reservoirs in One of the priority reservoirs for normalization is the Ria-Rio Reservoir. Geographically, the Ria-Rio Reservoir is located in the East Jakarta area, which is a lowland area. Therefore, it impacts the area around the Ria-Rio Reservoir, which is prone to flooding. To optimize the normalization of the Ria-Rio Reservoir, the Jakarta Provincial Government has relocated residents. The relocation was carried out in stages in September and December, with a total of 621 households.

Relocation or resettlement is the process of moving residents from a residential location that is not following its designation to a new location prepared under the city development plan (Lauer, Delos Reyes, and Birkmann 2021). Many problems were encountered during the relocation implementation; namely, the first communication did not go well between CA, Kayu Putih Village, and Pulogadung District management. Second, some residents have not received flats in the second phase of relocation. There are many actors in the relocation of the Ria-Rio Reservoir, namely state actors, political-economic structures, business actors, and the public. These actors in the implementation of the relocation do not have the same interest in relocating residents but rather an interest in seeking profit from community leaders and residents of the Ria-Rio Reservoir. Community leaders and residents of the Ria-Rio Reservoir should help the relocation

process succeed, but not in the relocation of the Ria-Rio Reservoir residents. Implementing a policy is not easy, especially in achieving common goals; making a good and fair public policy is difficult. Furthermore, it is even more challenging to implement it in a form and way that satisfies everyone, including those who are considered clients. Another problem is the difficulty in meeting the demands of various groups, leading to conflict, which encourages the development of political thinking as conflict (Yanda et al. 2010).

The program for building mass flats is one of the government's efforts to provide decent housing for its citizens. This program is motivated by general national problems related to expanding slum settlements in big and metropolitan cities. The limited management staff in the local government and the many problems in occupancy and management require proper attention and handling. Because with good occupancy and management, it will increase the value of the sustainability of the flats (Sidik and Mulya 2012). So that problems such as transfer of ownership do not occur. In addition, proper occupancy and management will optimize the occupancy of the built-up condominium units, which will help reduce the number of national housing backlogs (Amelia and Guswandi 2019).

This increasing demand for housing is also facing land availability for housing development in urban areas. The limited condition of urban land is increasingly felt, especially for providing houses for low-income people. The government and non-profit organizations have initiated initiatives to address the scarcity of housing for low-income people by making plans and patterns of housing finance for low-income people (Santoso and Anggraini 2021). However, until now, the government's ability to provide housing is very limited. The limited ability of the government to provide housing for low-income people has unwittingly spurred the emergence of unorganized housing areas so that they become slum areas (Algayerova 2019; Prabawa 2020).

However, the slums of this residential area cannot be left alone; the government, as the person in charge of development, is trying to overcome this slum area. One of the activities that can be observed is handling slum areas through the provision of flats. However, the provision of flats originally intended to overcome horizontal slums has unwittingly changed the form of slums horizontally and vertically. Therefore, it sees the changes in the quality of the settlement environment, and it is necessary to review the physical building planning of flats so that they are followed by non-physical planning, which plays a big role in the sustainability of flats.

Housing and settlements are basic rights for every Indonesian citizen. However, the state is obliged to provide adequate housing facilities for Low-Income Communities (MBR) who have not been able to meet their housing needs (Antolin, Dang, and Oxley 2005). The MBR's powerlessness in meeting housing is further exacerbated by supporting facilities and increasingly expensive land areas. This forces MBR to live in uninhabitable and slum dwellings. Through the Slum and Dense Area Arrangement program (Sartika 2018), the government chose a way out to build vertical housing in the form of simple flats for low-income people. Several years ago, the government held the National Movement for the Development of a Million Flats (GNPSR) in 2003, which was proclaimed, but what happened was that the supply of flats was still slow.

Therefore, the changing living culture is a reluctance factor for (prospective) residents to living in flats. Low-income people who have stronger social power than other social classes need communal space. This somewhat lacking pattern can be found in the flats. Besides increasing space as needed, it is not easy to accommodate a massive flat structure (Spillman, Biess, and MacDonald 2012). For example, the residents' desire to keep animals as entertainment cannot be accommodated.

However, residents can still adapt to the flat environment. From research on the arrangement between dwellings, it was found that the residents felt the conditions were quite good. However, the conditions complained about were selfish residents, the emergence of an individualistic attitude, the clothesline lacked light. In the life of living in flats, there are also cases of social clashes between fellow residents. However, the level of impact experienced is still within reasonable limits. There are 21% of the residents of the flats who have experienced social conflicts. However, in general, it is still in a harmonious situation.

Even though the social conditions are harmonious, the residents of the flats feel the need for supervision in their daily lives. It raises the idea of a symptom of the need for a better atmosphere to live together in flats. Concerns about the emergence of social conflicts among the residents of the flats can be seen from the various responses of residents who require supervision in 61% of respondents. In addition, there is one more problem, namely the construction of flats on the city's outskirts, causing a feeling of being kept away from work for low-income people, especially for the residents of the flats who are the people affected by the relocation. Reluctance, for this reason, arose a lot. There is also a tendency to increase routine expenses, compared to living in the previous location, so there are a reluctance (prospective) residents to inhabit the flats that have been built.

#### **Communication**

According to some people from Ria-Rio Reservoir born and raised there, relocation is not easy and can be done because their house belongs to their parents/predecessors, which was purchased with a letter (black and white). Although the validity of the letter of sale and land purchase cannot be decided in court, they hope to receive compensation costs by the nominal amount that occurred when they first bought the land.

Meanwhile, for the immigrant communities in Ria-Rio Reservoir, being relocated is a hope to get a better life compared to when they had to live renting a house in Ria-Rio Reservoir. As stated by Mrs. Supadmi, "that I was not born and was not raised on the banks of the Ria-Rio Reservoir but has lived in a house by renting a house there since I was a teenager and while living there, I was not able to buy a house or land like the indigenous people there, so that when the government will relocate the residents there, My family and I are very happy." Meanwhile, according to Mr. Ahmad, "I was born and raised by my parents in the Ria-Rio Reservoir, my parents' house has been here for a long time; no one has ever acknowledged that another party owns this village island. We are indigenous people there, have land certificates, which we can account, we have suffered losses due to the relocation of the Ria-Rio Reservoir."

Differences of opinion, as mentioned above, are things that can occur when the government will implement a policy. Pros and cons are natural things that happen; Mr. Ahmad also hopes that the Jakarta Regional Government can provide compensation for land ownership shown by the indigenous people of Ria-Rio Reservoir. However, according to the Head of the Cakung sub-district, Teguh Hendrawan, "all the land certificates showed by the Ria-Rio Reservoir residents have not been proven true, so they are still waiting; for the court process." If the validity has been proven, the Regional Government will provide compensation as expected by the original residents of the Ria-Rio Reservoir, while the relocation process must continue because the area is one of the flood-prone areas.

Mrs. Supadmi, as one of the relocated residents, said that she and her family were grateful for the activities of the Jakarta Regional Government, which relocated the residents of the Ria-Rio Reservoir. She had occupied the banks of the Ria-Rio reservoir from 1970 to 2014 and could not afford to buy a house there, so she could only rent a house. He and his family already have KTPs from Kayu Putih Village and easily got the ALBO Flats in Cakung Barat Village. He said that at first, he knew that residents would be relocated only from the words of the surrounding residents. However, the Head of the RT had not been able to explain, so that it had been a matter of discussion for the residents for a long time, and of course, if left for a long time, it would cause unrest. Therefore, he and residents hope that the Regional Government does not issue sentences that disturb the community.

Another thing that hinders the relocation process is that many residents of the Ria-Rio reservoir still do not yet have a Jakarta Identity Card, so the data collection process is slow. However, it was conveyed by the Head of the Flats Management Unit, Said Ali. He also stated that he had conducted socialization and fair data collection for all residents ready to be relocated, including when they were going to occupy the unit in the flat. It was done by drawing lots that were witnessed and documented in detail and thoroughly. However, when the series of activities took place, there were still residents who did not obey the agreement/regulations that had been made by the Housing Office, for example, when the data was recorded per family, they had drawn lots and found the unit on the 3<sup>rd</sup> floor and had signed the agreement.

The lack of clarity of information provided to the people who will be relocated ultimately hampers the process of implementing local government policies. There are differences in explanations between one unit and another in conveying socialization, data collection, and placement of residents in flats. There are still residents who conclude differently from other residents who are both about to be relocated. Differences of opinion and mindset must be communicated wisely by the parties involved so that the final goal can be carried out properly. The people who will be relocated hope that all questions in doubt about carrying out the move will be answered as quickly as possible with clear clarity and even want a guarantee. These questions include:

- a) Can school-age children easily attend school in the new location?
- b) Can people who have received Raskin (rice for the poor) get it back in a new location?



- c) How can workers reach their work locations if residents have to travel further distances to their work locations after moving to the flats, requiring greater transportation costs?
- d) Can public health services be more secure in flats?
- e) If they have moved to the flat, can they immediately get a new Identity Card (KTP) according to the flat address?
- f) If the residents had stalls or similar businesses in the old settlements, would they still be able to open the same businesses when they were in the flats?

There are so many questions that must be answered by good communication from the Jakarta Regional Government apparatus so that all people have more confidence that if they follow the directions of the Jakarta Regional Government, their lives will be better than all areas of life. For example, the reasons for the residents of the flats, who consider the monthly routine fees to be paid to the manager to be expensive, are among others: The costs are not proportional to the monthly income; only people with high incomes can rent; Not by the facilities of an open room with a cement floor; not suitable for the poor economically down; it is difficult to find money while the price of necessities is high; the salary received cannot be saved anymore; not following the current life which is in crisis; small but expensive.

Meanwhile, the reasons for being less expensive are: Compared to other rental housing the flats have better facilities; less high compared to other places; cheaper than renting a private house. Meanwhile, those who consider it reasonable have reasons that the cost is still affordable; indeed, the ability of all apartment residents are still affordable for weak economies; reason for the poor according to income and market.

#### **Resource**

Kasatgas Pol PP Kelurahan Kayu Putih, Mr. Ali Sadikin said that residents living on the banks of the Ria-Rio Reservoir needed an even more incentive approach. However, there were limited numbers of Pol PP members from Kelurahan Kayu Putih, so that during the socialization process from beginning to end, they were always assisted by Satpol members. PP Pulo Gadung District and Sat Pol PP East Jakarta City Administration. The limited number of human resources is not only experienced by the Kelurahan Sat Pol PP, but the apartment management unit also has a similar problem so that the number of apartments serving is not proportional to the number of residents who will be relocated.

Mr. Said Ali conveyed the same thing as the Head of UPT Rusunawa when collecting data on residents who want to be relocated it takes a long time, this is due to the lack of human resources, while the number of residents served is not proportional to the number of uni UPT Rusunawa apparatus. In addition, he added that there was no budget available during the data collection process for residents who would be relocated so that each related unit used self-help funds according to their respective capabilities.

Apart from the number side, the Jakarta Regional Government officials who implement the relocation policy still do not have a good quantity. It was conveyed by several residents who also shared the story of the relocation stage. "There are still elements from the Jakarta Regional Government apparatus who cannot properly explain

all the things that are asked by residents who will be relocated," said Mrs. Supadmi (one of the relocated residents) so that people feel like they are being played with it.

#### ***Disposition/Characteristic***

There are still elements of the Regional Government apparatus that lack commitment and honesty in implementing the relocation of the residents of the Ria-Rio Reservoir to Rusunawa. Mr. Ahmad conveyed it as one of the original residents of the Ria-Rio reservoir who was relocated to Rusunawa. At the beginning of the socialization, he said that if residents had proof of ownership of land or buildings, they would receive compensation money, but in reality, residents who had shown land ownership certificates did not receive compensation.

In implementing the construction of flats, three parties play a role: the builder, the building and the apartment environment itself, and the apartment's occupants. These three parties have elements and inhibiting factors in the implementation of the apartment development program. The apartment builder is broadly divided into two, namely, from the government and the private sector. From the government side, it is divided into two, namely central agencies which the APBN finances. Such as the State Ministry of Public Housing and the Ministry of Public Works. Regional agencies that use APBD both at the Provincial and Regency/City levels. Mr. Maryadi is the Head of the Technical Implementation Unit (UPT) Rusunawa Pulogebang. He served as the Head of the UPT on January 8, 2016. The problems experienced by every relocated resident were no problems in terms of housing but in terms of empowerment. Pak Maryadi saw that the previous manager only cared about the rent, and if a resident was late paying, the resident was immediately evicted. Even though the government initially relocated the residents, now the residents are being evicted again. Therefore, he seeks to empower them so that they can rise and continue to survive. According to him, when the residents are relocated far from their place of origin, their livelihood automatically starts from null again. Moreover, it is not an easy matter. The effort made by his team is to allow every citizen in this flat to trade anything. However, He does not just let them go and often gives feedback to traders to improve the quality of their merchandise. He has contacted several company agencies to sponsor the residents' businesses in the flats concerning capital. He also seeks to obtain capital funds from banks so that its citizens can develop their businesses even more. In addition to freeing his residents to sell around the flats, and he also empowers residents who have official certificates such as security guards, administrative divisions, and others to work in the flats. However, he will openly rebuke his citizens if any of them do not obey the rules, because according to him, every citizen who lives in the flats must obey the regulations. If the residents feel reluctant to obey the rules, firmly states that the residents should leave and live elsewhere.

The delay in the program of building flats is also more or less influenced by the uninhabited buildings of the existing flats. Constraints on flats are neglected infrastructure and delays in the handover process from the builder to the manager. In Rusunawa Pulogebang, several communities are formed, including Youth flats, farmer groups, Muslim and Christian communities, waste (for waste banks), batik, culinary communities, and cooperation. All these communities merged into one group on Whatsapp, and also he deliberately merged the group with the group from Udin Flats. His

goal is to create a sense of competitiveness to advance his flat. From the communities formed, he sorts out each work program (proker) from the community to streamline the time and energy spent. For example, the culinary community is only allowed to sell on weekends because if they sell on weekdays, the risk of leftover and wasted food is also significant. Then there was an idea from another community to raise funds by washing residents' motorbikes. Maryadi considered it inappropriate because residents did not need motorbike washing services, and residents preferred to wash their motorbikes. He hopes that the existence of this community can bring Rusunawa's name to the outside community, and he has packaged this rusunawa based on tourism. In short, and he wants to make the flat an icon. In addition to branding the image of various work programs (brokers) from the community, it can also be a different entertainment for its citizens, such as gymnastics, which is held once a week, food bazaars every weekend, and others. Because he wants to make the flat an icon, he discusses a work program in meetings that can last until midnight.

Seeing Basuki's figure, he seemed to have a friend. He considered Basuki as someone who did not follow the majority. Basuki dared to be different to uphold justice. He even dared to take actions that could endanger both his position and his life. An obvious example is this relocation. The government's intention is good by moving residents who occupy state land to a suitable place to live with various facilities provided. However, he regretted that the government did not provide socialization to residents who would be relocated so that many residents were not ready for this relocation. Furthermore, it is normal for problems to adapt to the relocation site, especially in the livelihoods section.

#### ***Factors Supporting the Implementation of Government Policy***

The arrangement and maintenance of the environment have a very close relationship with community empowerment. For example, in a simple apartment environment, part of the daily rent is generally not used to maintain or carry out activities related to maintaining the quality of the residential environment but rather to work for a higher income. On the other hand, the daily activities of homemakers are generally used to look after and raise children or help their husbands in trading or doing other businesses.

In social relations, the factor of the length of stay in flats can make social interactions possible; this can be seen from most residents (68% of respondents) claiming to have lived in flats for more than two years. It makes the social life of the community among the citizens has been formed. Social relations can be supported if the occupants are more permanent and do not change. The results of field observations show several positive things that need to be maintained, such as structuring residential units and environmental blocks for simple rental flats in the Cakung Barat Village, showing the establishment of social relations between residents to support social relations. It is realized through:

- a) Making the hallway in front of the building can function as a terrace.
- b) It can be used to provide shared space on each floor such as stair hall, landing, e
- c) nd others. Utilization of the ground floor of the building for public functions and to support social interaction.

- d) They prepare locations for the use of environmental facilities close to the business activities of low-income communities in the form of providing stalls and stalls.
- e) The existence of green open spaces / with pavements that are public and equipped with facilities and infrastructure that support the existence of public spaces, such as the provision of park benches, lighting, pavement, trash cans, play/exercise facilities/shade elements (umbrellas, plants/canopies).
- f) It has facilitated the opportunity to sell in the form of street vendors. It can be through localization of traders or spread out at predetermined strategic human meeting points. Another thing that is considered lacking and needs attention from the results of field observations is the need to provide places as communal drying rooms to avoid using hallways and drying rooms in places that have the potential to reduce the visual quality of buildings and the environment, by meeting the requirements.
- g) In carrying out the management of Rusunawa, careful planning is needed for the implementation of good management. According to Friedman (1974: 5), planning is a way of thinking to overcome social and economic problems, to produce something in the future. The target is the collective will and strives for coherence in policies and programs. Planning requires deep thought and can be accepted by the community. In this case, social and economic planning must pay attention to the community's aspirations and directly or indirectly involve the community.

According to Law Number 20 of 2011 concerning Flats, what is meant by flats are high-rise buildings built in an environment that is divided into functionally structured parts, both horizontally and vertically, and are units that each -each can be owned and used separately, especially for dwellings equipped with shared parts, shared objects, and shared land. Therefore, the implementation of flats aims to:

- a) Ensuring the realization of livable and affordable flats in a healthy, safe, harmonious, and sustainable environment as well as creating integrated settlements to build economic, social, and cultural resilience;
- b) They are improving the efficiency and effectiveness of using space and land and providing green open spaces in urban areas to create a complete, harmonious, and balanced residential area by considering the principles of sustainable development and environmental insight.
- c) It is reducing the area and preventing the emergence of housing and slums.
- d) It is directing the development of urban areas that are harmonious, balanced, efficient, and productive.
- e) It is fulfilling social and economic needs that support the lives of residents and the community while still prioritizing the goal of fulfilling the needs of decent housing and settlements, especially for low-income people.
- f) Ensuring the fulfillment of the need for decent and affordable flats, especially for low-income communities in a healthy, safe, harmonious, and sustainable environment in an integrated housing and settlement management system, and
- g) Provide legal certainty in the provision, occupancy, management, and ownership of flats.

Matari (2015) explains that policy implementation is activities or actions taken by the government (bureaucracy), both individually and in organizations. These activities are carried out to achieve the objectives of the policies that the government has issued. The effectiveness of a policy also depends on the attitude of the policy implementer. Because one of the components of the policy is how to achieve the objectives of the policy objectives, this method also contains policy components. Among others, who is the implementer or the implementor? How much and where the funds are obtained, who is the target group, how is the program implemented? Moreover, how successful is it? So it is crucial to see how the attitudes or actions taken by policy implementers are (Ajzen and Gilbert Cote 2008).

The need for housing is a necessity for all levels of society. Law Number 1 of 2011 concerning Housing and Settlement Areas explains that a house is a building that functions as a suitable place to live, a means of fostering a family, a reflection of the dignity and worth of its inhabitants, and an asset for its owner. However, in Indonesia, meeting the need for livable housing is still one of the national problems that must be followed up immediately. The fulfillment of housing needs is still low, the main factor in the emergence of slum settlements. It is estimated that by 2020, on average, there are 1.15 million housing units that need to be facilitated every year. Currently, the construction/development of new houses has reached 600,000 units per year. As a result, the number of housing shortages (backlog) has increased from 4.3 million units in 2000 to 5.8 million units in 2004 and 7.4 million units at the end of 2009. Moreover, this condition is expected to continue to accumulate in the future due to the average new household growth is 820,000 housing units per year. Thus, while the ability to provide housing only reached twenty percent (20%) of the total housing needs, even up to 2000, there were still 4,338.

The government has implemented various efforts to reduce the number of slum areas. The culmination of these efforts is that the government participates in committing in the eyes of the world to realize the Millennium Development Goals. In this commitment, there are eight world goals that the government must immediately realize. One of them is ensuring environmental sustainability, which is the seventh goal. There are three targets in the seventh goal, one of which is to significantly improve the lives of the poor in slums by 2020. The improvement in the lives of the poor in slums has also received attention from the new development paradigm of the Sustainable Development Goals, which is a continuing commitment to the MDGs. Developing countries carry out this global commitment, but all countries must participate in sustainable development. It proves that the problem of slum settlements is a problem that all countries in the world must address. In a social policy, the government as the organizer of the state must act so that the less fortunate people can become well-being. A policy implemented certainly has a purpose. However, if the policy's objectives have not been appropriately implemented, the government needs to know the source of the cause of the goals not being achieved. The government needs to know the location of the failure so that the same thing does not happen again. According to Purdon et al. (2001), policy evaluation is a process to assess how far a policy is producing results, namely by comparing the results obtained with the goals or targets of the determined policy. The objectives and targets of this policy are seen from how far the implementation process produces output in the community. Policy

evaluation is used to determine the future sustainability of the policy and aims to improve the policy. Policy evaluation if it intends to know four aspects, namely: (1) the policy-making process, (2) the implementation process, (3) the consequences of the policy, and (4) the effectiveness of the policy impact. In evaluating this Rusunawa policy, the focus will be on the second aspect, also known as implementation evaluation (Knoepfel et al., 2011). Dunn (2018) states that evaluation can be done before the policy (formative evaluation) or after the policy (summative evaluation). In other words, summative evaluation is an assessment of the impact of a program or commonly called an outcome evaluation, and formative evaluation, which is a process of assessing the process of the program, which is also called process evaluation.

Actors and institutions are in a relationship in policy, namely the policy universe and the policy subsystem. A policy universe is a fundamental unit containing all international, state, social and institutional actors that directly and indirectly influence a particular policy area. The Policy Subsystem is a space where relevant actors discuss policy issues, convince and bargain for the sake of achieving interests. In these interactions, the actor often gives up and modifies goals in return for concessions from others (Joshi and Narayan 2016). In domestic organizations, two dimensions impact the ability of the state to make and implement policies, namely autonomy and capacity. Autonomy refers to the degree of independence of the state from self-interest and conflicting social pressures. The state has not only autonomy but also capacity. Countries must have the ability to make and implement effective policies. The domestic state system consists of: a. State actors consist of elected officials and appointed officials; b. Societal Structures and Actors consist of political-economic structures, business actors, and labor c. Political structures and actors consist of the public, think-tank, research organizations, political parties, mass media, and interest groups. According to Tan (2017), resettlement entails the planned and controlled relocation of populations from one physical place to another. Though frequently conflated with other forms of migration, resettlement can occur only when choosing to remain in one's original place is fundamentally constrained by actual or perceived coercion.

The Role of Actors is divided into the background of the rejection of relocation. There is a role for actors in the policy subsystem framework and critical studies in implementing the relocation of the Ria-Rio Reservoir population. Background of rejection of relocation the relocation of the residents of Ria-Rio reservoir was carried out in stages, the first stage amounting to 281 households (KK) and the second stage amounting to 340 households. The new residence locations for the residents of the Ria-Rio Reservoir are the Pinus Elok Flats and the West Cakung Flats. Some obstacles resisted the relocation process during the implementation, especially in the second stage (Santoso and Anggraini 2021). However, based on the aspects of unsuccessful relocation according to Job Hazard Analysis (JHA) (Crutchfield and Roughton 2014), namely inadequacy of new sites, distance from livelihoods and social networks, socio-culturally inappropriate settlement layouts, lack of community participation, and underbudgeting of relocation costs, these aspects are not relevant to the context of the relocation of residents of the Ria-Rio Reservoir.

Based on the aspects of the unsuccessful relocation according to JHA (Azady, Widowati, and Rahayu 2018), it is entirely inversely proportional because the relocation

of the Ria-Rio Reservoir residents is entirely inversely proportional Jakarta Provincial Government has carried out all these aspects. However, this is not the case; the relocation of residents of the Ria-Rio Reservoir continues to experience resistance and obstacles in its implementation. The refusal of the second stage of relocation by the residents of the Ria-Rio Reservoir was caused by the Chairman of CA, Kayu Putih Village, as a community figure who was only interested in seeking profit.

The Head of CA, Kayu Putih Village, rents and gets money from Boyke's heirs to keep the residents alive around the Ria-Rio Reservoir. The residents of Ria-Rio Reservoir also get money from Boyke's heirs to survive to indicate a motive for seeking material or monetary gain. The problem in relocating the residents is also caused by the livelihood aspect located far from the new residence. He explained success in relocation, one of which was about livelihoods, not in a specific location. This condition does not occur with the concept of spatial planning in Jakarta. Actors implementing the relocation of residents of Ria-Rio Reservoir consist of state actors, business actors, political-economic structure, and the public. State actors are the Governor and Deputy Governor of Jakarta and their subordinates. The business actor is PT Pulo Mas Jaya as the owner of the land around the Ria-Rio Reservoir. Political, the economic structure is a community figure around the Ria-Rio Reservoir or Pendongkelan Village. Finally, the public is residents around Ria-Rio Reservoir. In this section, the researcher will discuss the interaction of the actors involved in relocating the residents of the Ria-Rio Reservoir in the subsystem policy framework. The following is a graph of actors in implementing the relocation of residents of the Ria-Rio Reservoir within the framework of the policy subsystem.

The main actors who play a role in the formulation of the relocation policy for the Ria-Rio Reservoir residents are the Governor of Jakarta and the Deputy Governor of Jakarta and their subordinates. The role of the Governor and Deputy Governor of Jakarta in implementing the relocation of residents of the Ria-Rio Reservoir is to establish good communication with the residents and coordinate with their subordinates in the process of relocating residents to flats. Coordination is carried out with the Jakarta Housing and Government Building Office, PT Pulomas Jaya, and the Company's Corporate Social Responsibility. Coordination with the Housing Office and the Jakarta Regional Government Building regarding the provision of flats. PT Pulo Mas Jaya regarding the provision of aid money to the residents. Final, The Company's CSR is related to the provision of household furniture for the residents of the Ria-Rio Reservoir. The role of Bappeda in implementing the relocation of residents of the Ria-Rio Reservoir is not directly related to the movement of residents. The Bappeda does not have direct contact with field actors in relocating residents. Therefore, the role of Bappeda in implementing the relocation of residents is not directly involved but only ensures the sustainability of the development program. Relocation is a public policy that is a priority for the government. The role of Pulogadung District in implementing the relocation of the residents of the Ria-Rio Reservoir is to facilitate the residents in the relocation process by holding socialization four times in the first and second stages of relocation.

The socialization was carried out as an intense form of communication to accommodate the wishes and expectations of the residents, although, in practice, there were obstacles in the second relocation stage. In addition, Pulogadung District coordinates with related parties from the socialization process to the movement of

residents to the available flats. The Pulogadung Sub-district coordinates, among others, with PT Pulo Mas Jaya as the landowner around the Ria-Rio Reservoir, Kayu Putih Village, which involves CA and the Housing Office and Regional Government Building, especially the Region III Flat Management Unit as a provider of flats. Flat Management Unit (UPRS) Region III. The role of UPRS Region III in implementing the relocation of residents of the Ria-Rio Reservoir is to coordinate with the Pulogadung Subdistrict in providing flat units to the residents of the Ria-Rio Reservoir. The flats provided by the Housing and Regional Government Buildings Office of Jakarta Province, particularly UPRS Region III, are the Pinus Elok Flats and the Cakung West Flats, East Jakarta. In addition, UPRS Region III also coordinates with the East Jakarta City Administration Satpol PP and CSR parties. In providing CSR assistance items, UPRS Region III coordinates with the managers of each flat, namely the Pinus Elok Flats and the West Cakung Flats.

Outline, The role of UPRS Region III in the first stage went smoothly, but in the second stage, the relocation experienced problems due to the number of residents who exceeded the quota of flats. As a result, some residents who have not received flats and stowaway residents who are not native residents of the Ria-Rio Reservoir appear. The East Jakarta Administrative City Civil Service Police Unit (Satpol PP) The East Jakarta Administrative City Satpol PP plays a role in bringing order to several residents around the Ria-Rio Reservoir. Satpol PP is in direct contact with residents around the Ria-Rio Reservoir. However, the East Jakarta City Administration Satpol PP held control not directly but through a series of processes. The process consists of giving a warning letter (SP), an appeal letter, and finally controlling it. After the control was carried out by the East Jakarta Administrative City Satpol PP, the East Jakarta Administrative City Satpol PP did not allow displaced residents. Furthermore, the East Jakarta Administrative City Satpol PP coordinated with the East Jakarta City Administration Social Service to build temporary tents. In addition, the Satpol PP also assisted in the movement of residents to the Pinus Elok Flats and the West Cakung Flats. Kayu Putih Village, The role of Kayu Putih Village is to conduct socialization and interact directly with the management of CA Kayu Putih Village and residents of Ria-Rio Reservoir. In addition, Kayu Putih Village also assisted Pulogadung District in collecting data on residents in the first relocation stage. However, the involvement of Kelurahan Kayu Putih is only in the first stage of relocation, while the second stage is not involved. This condition occurred because of the involvement of the management of CA Kelurahan Kayu Putih in hindering the process of relocating residents. National Unity and Politics (Kesbangpol) East Jakarta Administrative City Kesbangpol's role in implementing the relocation of residents of Ria-Rio Reservoir is to monitor the area around Ria-Rio Reservoir looking for information on actual conditions in the field and parties who are provocateurs through closed security. The Kesbangpol; It is done to anticipate any disturbances or obstacles at the time of controlling residents. The Kesbangpol in implementing the relocation of residents of the Ria-Rio Reservoir is to monitor the area around the Ria-Rio Reservoir, seeking information on the actual conditions in the field and those who are provocateurs of the residents through closed security.

East Jakarta City Administration Social Service Sub-dept: The role of East Jakarta City Administration Social Sub-dept. in implementing the relocation of Ria-Rio Reservoir residents is to coordinate with East Jakarta Satpol PP to provide operational vehicles and



tents for the residents of Ria-Rio Reservoir. It is done as a form of responsibility of the Jakarta Provincial Government in protecting residents and not letting residents suffer.

Elementary Education Sub-Department (Sudin Dikdas) of East Jakarta City Administration: the role of the East Jakarta Administration of Basic Education Sub-department in implementing the relocation of residents of the Ria-Rio Reservoir is to assist and facilitate the school transfer process for the children of the Ria-Rio Reservoir resident with an easy process. Other than that, the Education Sub-dept. of the East Jakarta City Administration also held a PAUD Playground in the Pinus Elok Flats and the Study Hours Pilot Area in the Pinus Elok Flats. However, the PAUD TP and Night Study Hours have only been implemented in the Pinus Elok Flats, while the West Cakung Flats have not been implemented because they are still in progress. Cakung District Health Center: The role of the Cakung District Health Center in carrying out the relocation of residents of the Ria-Rio Reservoir to the Pinus Elok Flats and the West Cakung Flats is to provide basic health services for former residents of the Ria-Rio Reservoir in the Pinus Elok Flats. The role of the Cakung District Health Center focuses on improving the health quality of former residents of the Ria-Rio Reservoir. Health services aim to improve residents' quality of life in the new location, although in practice, it has only been implemented in the Pinus Elok Flats. The West Cakung Flat does not yet exist because it is close to the Village Health Center. District Military Commander Pulogadung: is Koramil Pulogadung took an active role in socializing and communicating about the relocation of residents. Other than that. The Koramil also approached the residents through counseling which described that the conditions in the new location would be better than the previous conditions in Pendongkelan Village or around the Ria-Rio Reservoir. In addition, Koramil Pulogadung provides counseling on healthy living and clean living to increase residents' awareness that their location is not suitable for residents to live in it.

The role of the public in implementing the relocation of the Ria-Rio Reservoir residents is related to the background, values, norms that are considered in the existence of a policy. The public actors in implementing the relocation of the Ria-Rio Reservoir residents are the residents of Pendongkelan Village or the Ria-Rio Reservoir residents. Residents of Ria-Rio Reservoir or Residents of Pendongkelan Village The involvement of residents in the first and second stages of the relocation of Ria-Rio Reservoir residents is only limited to determining the compensation fee from Rupiahs participating in the draw for flats, registering for assistance money up to moving to new locations, namely the Pinus Elok Flats and the Cakung West Flats, East Jakarta. A Critical Review of the Role of Actors in the implementation of the relocation of residents of the Ria-Rio Reservoir Based on the opinion of (Joshi and Narayan 2016), the actors in the relocation of the residents of the Ria-Rio Reservoir consist of state actors, business actors, political-economic structures and the public.

The actors who played a role in the relocation of the residents of the Ria-Rio Reservoir contradict the actors described by Ramesh and Michael. Based on the data found by the researcher, it can be concluded that the political-economic structure and the public that should support the relocation policy of the Jakarta Provincial Government lead to business actors. It can be seen from the motive for seeking profit or profit in the form of money, both from the Chair of Citizens Association/CA (RW), Kayu Putih Village, and residents of Ria-Rio Reservoir or residents of Pendongkelan Village. The Head of CA,

Kayu Putih Village, owns many rented lands on the former Boyke land and benefits from the rent. Residents of the Ria-Rio Reservoir were given money from Boyke's heirs to survive on the land claimed to belong to Boyke. Therefore, the role of actors described by Ramesh and Michael when conditioned in Indonesia, especially Jakarta, is not appropriate in relocating residents of the Ria-Rio Reservoir. In addition, based on data found by researchers in the field, it shows that there are actors from the military who are involved in the relocation of residents of the Ria-Rio Reservoir, namely the Commander of the military (Koramil). However, the actors in the policy subsystem do not include military actors. Koramil Pulogadung has a role in socializing and educating about residents' relocation and continues to approach residents so that they are willing to be relocated to flats. The involvement of military actors in the relocation of residents of the Ria-Rio Reservoir certainly shows that the concept of actors in the policy subsystem initiated by Ramesh and Michael is not relevant to the relocation case in Jakarta.

The Pulogadung Koramil, in the relocation of the Ria-Rio Reservoir residents, helps direct and disseminate information regarding the plan to relocate residents to flats. It is in line with Perlmutter's (2000:4) statement, which says that the army can become a vital partner for civilian politicians and other bureaucrats in formulating and implementing national security policies. Thus, it can be concluded that the military's involvement in the implementation of the relocation helps in socialization and counseling and keeps the relocation of residents going. Conclusion Based on the research results that have been done, the conclusion that can be given in this study is that the relocation policy of the Ria-Rio Reservoir residents is a form of urban management that involves many actors. Actors in the relocation of Ria-Rio Reservoir residents consist of state actors, business actors, political-economic structures, and the public. These actors have carried out roles according to their respective duties and functions, but political-economic structures and public actors lead to business actors. The Head of CA Kayu Putih Village, as political-economic structures and the residents of the Ria-Rio Reservoir as the public, hampered the relocation process in the second stage. It is because the land is claimed to belong to Boyke.

The Head of CA Kayu Putih Village has a profit motive because he has a rented house, and the residents also get money from Boyke's heirs to survive. In addition, based on the data found, there is a state actor from the military, namely the Commander of the Military District, who was also involved in relocating the residents of the Ria-Rio Reservoir. It is not following Ramesh and Michael's idea of actors in the policy subsystem. The Head of CA Kayu Putih Village has a profit motive because he has a rented house, and the residents also get money from Boyke's heirs to survive. In addition, based on the data found, there is a state actor from the military, namely the Commander of the Military District, who was also involved in relocating the residents of the Ria-Rio Reservoir. It is not by Ramesh and Michael's idea of actors in the policy subsystem. The Head of CA Kayu Putih Village has a profit motive because he has a rented house, and the residents also get money from Boyke's heirs to survive. In addition, based on the data found, there is a state actor from the military, namely the Commander of the Military District, who was also involved in relocating the residents of the Ria-Rio Reservoir. It is not following Ramesh and Michael's idea of actors in the policy subsystem.

**Conclusion and Recommendation**

Conclusion: several conclusions can be drawn, including strict facility restrictions are needed to prevent the transfer of rental rights from low-income people to the upper classes of society. This limitation can be carried out by agreeing to the prohibition of adding electrical power, adding connections, or adding electrical resources (gensets) in residential buildings. The existence of a Management Agency is deemed necessary by residents; this is evidenced by the high number of responses requiring a Management Agency by residents and supported again by the feeling of obedience to the Management Board owned by the residents. The reasons given by the occupants are the ease of information/regulations & about how to live within the Management Agency, supporting the creation of occupant comfort. Constraints in Provision of Housing on the need side; It is challenging to invite low-income people and residents of slums who are generally classified as poor to want to live in apartment units. The poor are often regarded as the cause of the slums of flats. They are blamed for being disorderly, difficult to regulate, and do not have a culture of inhabiting flats. The blocks and the residential environment provided are all unfit for habitation and not following their lifestyle. Runaway blocks have not grown into sustainable settlements.

Performance measurement cannot be done only on a one-year deadline. Performance has been disrupted by past policies that have prevented the achievement of housing development targets (rusunawa) from being fully met. A synergy between regional and central interests is needed. Program handling must be in synergy with other policies such as flood, labor, health, social and regional development. Social housing policy is dealing with a liberal economic market that marginalizes most of the people. Land acquisition policy is one of the main obstacles in dealing with problems in the housing sector. After the free rental period, an estate management system that is effective must be considered. It is clear to the residents in the rental flats. Jakarta is getting more difficult with residential land if it does not synergize with neighboring areas.

Recommendation: The government should socialize more with the public about the purpose of relocation so that people know more about the reasons for relocation to accept the government's decision. The government should also compensate people with land ownership certificates and Jakarta ID cards to adapt to their new living environment with new livelihoods. The community should support the government's relocation program because the government's purpose is for the public interest. Thus, there are several things that the government has not implemented following the agreement. The role of planners, environmental quality researchers, and residents are needed to minimize environmental quality pollution. The decrease in green open space is also a problem in this phenomenon of land function change. In this case, the government, planners, and residents should make appropriate regulations to prevent excessive development in the area so that residents can still survive green open spaces.

**References**

Ajzen, Icek, and Nicole Gilbert Cote. 2008. "Attitudes and the Prediction of Behavior." In *Attitudes and Attitude Change*, 289–311.

- Algayerova, Olga. 2019. *Guidelines on the Management and Ownership of Condominium Housing*. *Guidelines on the Management and Ownership of Condominium Housing*, UNECE. <https://doi.org/10.18356/8fd859d8-en>.
- Amelia, Siska, and Guswandi Guswandi. 2019. "The Stimulant Assistance Program Of Self-Help Housing In Attempts To Improve The Living Quality Of Middle-Class In Indonesia." *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science* 24 (August): 55–64. <https://doi.org/10.9790/0837-2408035564>.
- Antolin, Pablo, Thai-Thanh Dang, and Howard Oxley. 2005. "Poverty Dynamics in Four OECD Countries." *SSRN Electronic Journal*, no. 30: 2–4. <https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.223630>.
- Ariastita, Putu, and I Dewa Septanaya. 2020. "Tipologi Rumah Susun Sederhana Sewa (Rusunawa) Di Kota Surabaya." *Jurnal Teknik ITS* 9 (January): 93–98. <https://doi.org/10.12962/j23373539.v9i2.54718>.
- Arka, I Wayan. 2007. "Local Autonomy, Local Capacity Building and Support for Minority Languages: Field Experiences from Indonesia." In, 66–92. <https://doi.org/10.13140/RG.2.1.3407.3208>.
- Azady, Al, Evi Widowati, and Sri Rahayu. 2018. "Penggunaan Job Hazard Analysis Dalam Identifikasi Risiko Keselamatan Kerja Pada Pengrajin Logam." *HIGEIA (Journal of Public Health Research and Development)* 2 (October): 510–19. <https://doi.org/10.15294/higeia.v2i4.23564>.
- Creswell, John W. 2013. *Qualitative Inquiry & Research Design: Choosing among Five Approaches*. Sage. 1st ed. Nebraska: Pustaka Pelajar, Indonesia.
- Crutchfield, Nathan, and James Roughton. 2014. "Developing the Job Hazard Analysis." In, 235–48. <https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-12-396496-0.00012-4>.
- Dunn, William N. 2018. "Problem Structuring in Public Policy Analysis," no. 1983: 1–33. <https://journal.unpak.ac.id/index.php/palar/article/download/3076/pdf>.
- Gayo, Sabela, and Asmah Yeon. 2013. *Mandatory CSR Law in Indonesia: New Emerging Policy*. [https://www.researchgate.net/publication/258567475\\_Mandatory\\_CSR\\_Law\\_in\\_Indonesia\\_New\\_Emerging\\_Policy/citation/download](https://www.researchgate.net/publication/258567475_Mandatory_CSR_Law_in_Indonesia_New_Emerging_Policy/citation/download).
- Ishtiaq, Muhammad. 2019. "Book Review Creswell, J. W. (2014). *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative and Mixed Methods Approaches* (4th Ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage." *English Language Teaching* 12 (5): 40. <https://doi.org/10.5539/elt.v12n5p40>.
- Joshi, Pankaj S., and Ramesh Narayan. 2016. "Black Hole Paradoxes." *Journal of Physics: Conference Series* 759 (1): 1–57. <https://doi.org/10.1088/1742-6596/759/1/012060>.
- Knoepfel, Peter, Corinne Larrue, Frédéric Varone, and Michael Hill. 2011. "Evaluating Policy Effects." In, 220–49. <https://doi.org/10.1332/policypress/9781861349071.003.0010>.
- Lauer, Hannes, Mario Delos Reyes, and Joern Birkmann. 2021. "Managed Retreat as Adaptation Option: Investigating Different Resettlement Approaches and Their Impacts—Lessons from Metro Manila." *Sustainability* 13 (January): 829. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su13020829>.
- Prabawa, Made. 2020. "House Layout Typology Study in Slum Area, Case Study : Kampung

- Jawa, Denpasar, Bali." *Journal of Architectural Research and Education* 2 (May): 63. <https://doi.org/10.17509/jare.v2i1.24067>.
- Purdon, Susan, Carli Lessof, Kandy Woodfield, and Caroline Bryson. 2001. "Research Methods For Policy Evaluation," January, 44.
- Santoso, Vinny, and Diah Anggraini. 2021. "Kajian Perancangan Hunian Sehat Dan Terjangkau Bagi Pekerja Migran Di Tanah Abang." *Jurnal Sains, Teknologi, Urban, Perancangan, Arsitektur (Stupa)* 3 (May): 729. <https://doi.org/10.24912/stupa.v3i1.10732>.
- Sartika, MARIA. 2018. *Terbengkalainya Rumah Susun Di Pekanbaru*. <https://doi.org/10.31219/osf.io/3bm4w>.
- Sidik, Amelia, and Bodhiya Wijaya Mulya. 2012. "Pendekatan Analisis Data Menggunakan NVivo-Software Untuk Penelitian Desain Logo Museum Nasional Jakarta." *Nirmana* 13 (1): 2-5. <https://doi.org/10.9744/nirmana.13.1.1-4>.
- Simanjuntak, Dairi Sapta Rindu. 2017. "Hukum Lingkungan Internasional," 2. <http://ejournal.upbatam.ac.id/index.php/basis/article/download/437/284>.
- Spillman, Brenda C, Jennifer Biess, and Graham MacDonald. 2012. "Housing as a Platform for Improving Outcomes for Older Renters," no. April: 4-6.
- Statistics, Central Bureau of. 2020. *Rangkuman Statistik Pendidikan (RSP) Tahun 2017-2020. Sustainability*. 1st ed. Vol. 1. Jakarta. [http://publikasi.data.kemdikbud.go.id/uploadDir/isi\\_2B40A310-F17C-4315-AF34-1FBA51252C56\\_.pdf%09](http://publikasi.data.kemdikbud.go.id/uploadDir/isi_2B40A310-F17C-4315-AF34-1FBA51252C56_.pdf%09).
- Tan, Yan. 2017. "Resettlement and Climate Impact: Addressing Migration Intention of Resettled People in West China." *Australian Geographer* 48 (January): 1-23. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00049182.2016.1266593>.
- Yanda, P Z, Thomas Yatich, Washington Ochola, and N Ngece. 2010. "Natural Resource Management in the Context of Climate Change." In, 54.